

Local Solutions to Poverty (LSP)
Steering Committee Meeting on 7 February 2018

Minutes of Meeting
(sent to Bappenas since March 1, 2018)

Chair: Pungky Sumadi, Deputy Minister for Population and Employment, Bappenas

Participants: See attachment

1. This is a follow-up of Steering Committee (SC) meeting to discuss the revised proposal of Data for Results, LSP portfolio/programs updates and the LSP Operations Manual.
2. Key Agreed Decisions and Next Actions
 - The Data for Results: Managing to Deliver Services Locally Proposal is approved with the following conditions:
 - In the initial stage, the Steering Committee agreed that the program should focus on the issue of stunting.
 - The background study for inputs to RPJM on local data management should be implemented within the first year to align with the implementation of the government's program and as the program is expected to link with the KRISNA program.
 - During the 1st semester of program implementation, the team should conduct in depth discussions/consultations with government counterparts and KRISNA.
 - During the 2nd year, the team should work at the local level to determine how to assist local governments to collect, work with and use the data.
 - For the LSP Operations Manual, the Chair agreed with the proposed Operations Manual.
 - Bappenas suggested that relevant directors (such as Pak Pungkas, Pak Sumedi and Pak Dading) should be involved in future meetings, as relevant.
 - The next meeting is expected to be held in April 2018.

| Topic | Comments | Source | Response | Source |
|---|---|------------|---|---|
| | | | DFAT: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Thanking and agree with the revision of proposal. | Fleur Davies |
| Importance of Data Quality | Current facts on local data: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are many national (MoV, MoHA, etc) and sub-national data sources; Data quality is often poor, varied, lacks details and is not disaggregated; Data is often not transparent and not accessible to local government and public. | World Bank | | |
| Activity 1. Review Data Management and LG Performance System | During the first year: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Foster policy dialogue Support the exchange of data across government, at the central level (inter-ministry/Gol institutions) and/or central to local vice versa. The next year: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use the developed model to drive and influence/change government regulations | World Bank | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It would be interesting to see if the activity could connect the data on results with the financing aspect, and what would be the platform for this. Suggest working with KRISNA team on how to connect data with financing and how the data being utilized by KemenPANRB. KRISNA is government initiatives/program, which system is accessed by LGs. Suggest focusing more on a specific issue. Also, as there is already a lot of data available, the program should focus more on the flow of data (both at central level and between central and regions). | Pak Kennedy |
| Activity 2. Strengthening Local Data Management for National | Focus more on sectoral data, which will be dependent on discussions with technical working group (TWG) For the initial stage, propose to work on cross sectoral issues such as stunting. | World Bank | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggest activities should focus on issues such as poverty and stunting where LSP has experience and expertise. | Pak Pungky (Chair)/Pak Kennedy Pak Subandi |

| Topic | Comments | Source | Response | Source |
|--------------------------------|---|--------------------|--|-----------------------------------|
| Development Priorities | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data on stunting is important as it is cross sectoral, currently no existing data on cumulative level of stunting. | |
| Updates on LSP Programs | | | | |
| 1. Village Development | | | | |
| Village Law PASA | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As the Minister, Pak Bambang Brodjonegoro (Bappenas) is very concerned about dana desa, it would be good if the program can develop a brief analysis on dana desa usage. The analysis can become reference for the Minister's presentation to the President. Suggested to work with Pak Rudi's team, as he is the deputy responsible for improving the governance of regions/village. Pak Rudy should be involved to look more into the program's effectiveness. | Pak Pungky (Chair) | | |
| Village Innovations Program | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bappenas is supportive of the two ministerial lectures held at MoV as a knowledge exchange activity, as unlike conventional approaches that usually send Gol officials abroad this activity brought experts to Indonesia (funded by WB). See that the Bursa Inovasi Gampong/Desa (BIG) could also become the "vehicle" for Local Economic Development (LED), as both have similar objectives and targets. Suggest that LED pilot in VIP is merged with the LED program in Bappenas to be more efficient and cost effective (avoid creating a different system for similar activities). | Pak Pungky (Chair) | <p>This is confirmed. World Bank does not send government officials abroad. Instead the World Bank invites experts to Indonesia to share knowledge.</p> <p>This will be discussed further with the World Bank.</p> | <p>World Bank</p> <p>Ibu Vivi</p> |

| Topic | Comments | Source | Response | Source |
|------------------------------------|--|--------------------|--|------------|
| Local Economic Development | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It would be good if this program could include a data expert for specific economic activities. BIG/VIP and LED has similar targets to promote village economic development. For future, consider how this activity will be sustained operationally (has a system) and financially. | Pak Pungky (Chair) | There is a plan to hold a meeting on LED, and WB will bring together experts. The program is developing the design concept and the activity plan for the program will support. | Ibu Vivi |
| 2. Basic Service Delivery | | | | |
| Generasi Sehat & Cerdas | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bappenas would like to know what is the contribution of GSC in improving health services, what is the impact to the community. There should be systematic methodology to measure the impact. Suggested to have more comprehensive discussion on the effectiveness of GSC's intervention in term of funding and results. | Pak Pungky (Chair) | World Bank undertook a fourth round of Generasi Impact Evaluation. However, this IE focused on improvements in service delivery, rather than the integration strategy. Confirm that it is important to understand the impact of GSC. And that more systematic analysis could be undertaken to better understand GSC impacts. | World Bank |
| KIAT Guru | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supportive with this program, it is clear the intervention of KIAT Guru, whether the program is success or not, such program needs to be able to present the results and impact – not just simply highlight the achievement of its indicators. | Pak Pungky (Chair) | Confirm that the pilot's direct impact will be better understood following the completion of the pilot's impact evaluation end-line survey on teacher attendance, teacher service performance and student learning outcomes in March 2018. | World Bank |
| Frontline ECED Pilot | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The program has no local facilitators. It only has 12 national trainers (contracted by WB) who trained district trainers. These district trainers then trained the teachers using teaching modules (2013 PAUD modules) on teaching practice and how to conduct teaching, which were issued by DG Teachers and Educational Practitioners (DG TEP or DJ Guru & Tenaga Kependidikan/GTK). | World Bank | | |

| Topic | Comments | Source | Response | Source |
|--|---|--------------------|---|--------------------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The program will evaluate the results from the ECED pilot training approach, using tools developed by WB and UNICEF, to determine whether it had an impact on improving teachers' knowledge. WB will use the evaluation analysis and results to determine challenges/bottlenecks and inform potential scale ups. | | | |
| Nutrition & Early Years | No progress yet. The program is under preparation stage. | World Bank | | |
| 3. Analytics | | | | |
| Evaluations & Special Studies | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Since PNPM, WB has collected data, thus LSP now focuses more on strengthening the capacity of villages to use data as reference for policy making. The activity plan includes conducting training for village apparatus and cadres/facilitators on how to use their village data. On the BKN data analysis activity, it looks like WB is answering too many queries/requests from different stakeholders. | World Bank | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supportive with the plan activity, and remind the importance of having clear arrangement of the program intervention at village level. | Pak Pungky (Chair) |
| | | Pak Pungky (Chair) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The activity with MenPANRB is based on WB's needs to obtain data on civil servants. In return for obtaining the data, the Ministry requested WB to analyze the data for them. | World Bank |

Participants:

Bappenas

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------|---|
| 1. | Pungky Sumadi | Deputy Minister for Population and Employment |
| 2. | Kennedy Simanjuntak | Deputy Minister for Development Financing |
| 3. | Subandi | Deputy Minister for Human Development, Community and Culture |
| 4. | Vivi Yulaswati | Director for Poverty Alleviation and Social Welfare |
| 6. | Pungkas B. Ali | Director for Health and Nutrition for Community |
| 8. | Ahmad Dading Gunadi | Director for Small and Medium Enterprises and Cooperative |
| 9. | Riski Raisa Putra | Directorate for Poverty Alleviation and Social Welfare |
| 10. | Endah K.L | Directorate for Labor and Expansion of Employment Opportunity |
| 11. | Rayi P | Directorate for Disadvantaged Regions, Transmigration and Village |
| 12. | Mariska | Directorate for Small and Medium Enterprises and Cooperative |

DFAT

- | | | |
|----|-------------------|--|
| 1. | Fleur Davies | Minister-Counsellor, Governance & Human Development |
| 2. | Kristen Bishop | First Secretary, Poverty and Social Development |
| 3. | Deviana Dewi | Senior Program Manager, Poverty and Social Development |
| 4. | Darrell Hawkins | Second Secretary, Poverty and Social Development |
| 5. | Reninta Fitrianti | Program Manager, Poverty and Social Development |

MCA Indonesia

- | | | |
|----|------------------------|---|
| 1. | Lukas Laksono Adhyakso | Deputy Executive Director, Program |
| 2. | Iling Mursalin | Director, Community-based Health and Nutrition to Reduce Stunting Project |

World Bank

- | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|--|
| 1. | Christopher Finch | Sr. Social Development Specialist |
| 2. | Kathleen A. Whimp | Lead Public Sector Management Specialist |
| 3. | Noriko Toyoda | Sr. Governance Specialist |
| 4. | Dewi Susanti | Sr. Social Development Specialist |
| 5. | Samuel Thomas Clark | Sr. Social Development Specialist |
| 6. | Lily Hoo | Social Development Specialist |
| 7. | Yulia Herawati | Social Development Specialist |
| 8. | Daniel Seno Yusanto | Operations Officer |
| 9. | Ashlee Anne Schleger | Program Officer |
| 10. | Chatarina A. Widiarti | Program Assistant |
| 11. | Hardini Utami | Consultant |