

M&E and Special Studies

Quarterly Progress Report: April to June 2016

Summary Information	
Status	Active
Activity Number	P112032 (TF092195) P153589 (TFOA0461) P152466 (TF018564) P154636 (EW-P154636-ESW-TFOA0258) P154484 (TA-P154484-TAS-TFOA0258)
Task Team Leader(s)	Lily Hoo (lhoo@worldbank.org)
Executing Agency(ies)	PNPM Support Facility (PSF)/World Bank
Start date to Closing Date	May 26, 2008 to December 31, 2017 (115 months)
Geographic Coverage	National
Approved Budget	US\$15,629,194
Disbursements during the Quarter	US\$334,478
Cumulative Disbursements	US\$11,987,435

Progress
<p>Project Overview</p> <p>The monitoring and evaluation (M&E) activities conducted by the PSF aim to: (i) provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the results and impacts of PNPM Mandiri; (ii) conduct research in greater depth on special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia; and (iii) enhance the ability of Indonesian social science research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies.</p>
<p>Overall progress towards development objective</p> <p>The overall progress of the PSF Analytics Program (M&E and Special Studies) towards its project development objective (PDO) continues to be satisfactory. The PSF Analytics team continues to consistently support the Government of Indonesia (GOI) with policy formulation and program implementation through the provision of high quality, evidence-based analytical works in poverty alleviation, village development, and community empowerment. Since its inception in 2009, the PSF Analytics team has successfully completed 18¹ evaluations/thematic studies to support PNPM Mandiri and other smaller initiatives in response to the research needs of the projects. Utilizing a wide variety of mixed-methods, the team continues to provide excellent support to the GOI and other stakeholders, through delivering high-quality evaluation and analysis, while expanding partnerships in knowledge management and the dissemination of analytical products.</p> <p>The team has been working towards the completion of two key studies, namely the Generasi Performance Monitoring Survey (PMS) and the Rural Final Evaluation. The team has also focused on</p>

¹ A complete list of Analytics Products is available at: http://pnpm-support.org/sites/default/files/2015_psf_progress_report_midres.pdf

carrying out a number of special studies to address stakeholder interests, such as:

- The Village Governance and Community Empowerment study (the “Sentinel Village Study”), which aims to track Village Law (VL) implementation over a two-year period;
- The Accountability Initiatives Experiment, which tests out digit analysis in order to narrow down identification of potential fraud cases in Village Fund utilization; and
- The Female-headed Household Empowerment program (PEKKA) Qualitative study, which aims to understand how PEKKA cadres promote higher women participation in village development affairs.

The team continues to support Indonesia’s social research institutions to deliver high-quality analytical products through intensive capacity-building initiatives, namely the National Socioeconomic Survey (*Survey Sosial Ekonomi Nasional*, SUSENAS) Consumption Experiment, a capacity-building project with the National Statistic Agency (*Badan Pusat Statistik*; BPS) that aims to improve the quality of consumption data collected through its annual socioeconomic survey.

Key developments during the quarter

Throughout the second quarter of 2016, the team completed a number of activities that contribute towards achieving its development objective, as follows:

- **Rural Final Evaluation (Quantitative Method).** As part of the completion of the Rural program, this evaluation aims to measure the program impacts across four key components, namely (i) the Technical Quality of three types of infrastructures (roads & bridges, irrigation, and clean water supply systems); (ii) Economic Impact Analysis; (iii) Beneficiaries’ Satisfaction; and (iv) Revolving Loan Funds (RLFs). This quarter the team successfully completed data analysis on both the technical evaluation of the three types of infrastructure (component i) and the household survey (components ii, iii and iv) and is currently finalizing the report draft to be ready by July (Q3/2016);
- **Generasi Performance Monitoring Survey (PMS) 2014 (Mixed-Methods).** This study aims to track Generasi’s performance against its 12 result indicators by identifying and analyzing bottlenecks throughout program implementation. The team completed the quantitative portion of the report in 2015 and has more recently completed a draft of the qualitative report despite capacity challenges with the consulting firm under contract. Currently, the team is finalizing the report and the report is expected to be ready by July (Q3/2016);
- **Generasi Impact Evaluation (mixed-methods).** This fourth round of the Generasi Impact Evaluation aims to assess the program’s long-term impact, utilizing a randomized control trial (RCT) approach combined with qualitative methods to better understand how and why the program has achieved its impact. Together with the Generasi task team, the Analytics team carried out its first quantitative field test in May 2016 across two districts (Manggarai and Eastern Manggarai, NTT). The mission aims to elaborate on a number of methods about student learning assessment and will be utilized in this current round of impact evaluations. The mission was attended by key stakeholders, including the Director of Labor, the National Development Planning Agency (*Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional*; Bappenas), the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) Deputy Head of Mission in Indonesia, Ben Olken (Principal Investigator), and the Jakarta Poverty Action Lab (JPAL).

Additionally, in order to provide strategic guidance, the Generasi Impact Evaluation Steering Committee (*Pokja PNPM Generasi IE*) has been established this quarter. The steering committee will be chaired by the Director of Poverty Alleviation at Bappenas and co-chaired by the Director of

Basic Social Service, Ministry of Villages (MoV), and will involve the participation of key sectoral ministries, including the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education;

- **PEKKA Qualitative Study.** The objective of this study is to elaborate the role of PEKKA's cadres in promoting women participation in their communities, particularly in village development affairs. After training and field tests, five qualitative researchers were deployed to start data collection in four villages, four districts in West Java and West Nusa Tenggara from May 17 to June 3, 2016. Currently, the research team is finalizing the field notes and starting data analysis. It is expected that the initial findings and report draft will be ready by July (Q3/2016);
- **Village Governance & Community Empowerment Study (Mixed Methods).** Utilizing a wide range of quantitative and qualitative methods, this longitudinal study aims to observe VL implementation over two years to understand whether the principles of good governance (participation, transparency and accountability) stipulated in the law can be articulated into managing village resources in an accountable manner to benefit the community. On April 11, together with the SMERU Research Institute and VL task team, the PSF Analytics team initiated a teleconference with local researchers (*Pemantau Lapangan, PL*) from five study locations to learn from first-hand experience about the VL implementation since October 2015 and discuss ways to sharpen the focus of future study observations. Topics of discussion included the planning and budgeting process, community participation, the village facilitation process, and the role of facilitators. Teleconference participants saw the value in the teleconference and agreed that the teleconference should be carried out on a regular basis as a way to obtain quick progress updates on the VL implementation. In addition, progress on two main study components are described below:
 - **On the quantitative side**, data collection in 112 villages in five districts across three provinces has been completed. Furthermore, a consultant has been hired to perform the data analysis. It is expected that the analysis will be completed in August (Q3/2016); and
 - **On the qualitative side**, the baseline report is nearly complete and has been submitted to the team for final review, which will be ready in July (Q3/2016). In addition, following the first policy note published last quarter, SMERU is preparing a second policy note on the role of village council (*Badan Permusyawaratan Desa, BPD*) in Village Law implementation and will be ready by July (Q3/2016).
- **Accountability Initiative (Quantitative).** As part of key analytical works under the broader Village Law Programmatic Advisory Services and Analytics (PASA-VL), this experiment elucidates factors that enable or constrain good governance practices within communities or local government. The team initiated the testing of a 'digit analysis' method to assist the National Audit Board (BPK) in narrowing down potential fraud cases to be followed up by audit through systematic analysis on village expenditure reports. Results from the exercise are expected to support the establishment of the Village Information Management System (IFMIS) led by BPK and the revision of Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA) Ministerial Regulation No. 113/2014 regarding management of the village fund. Furthermore, piggybacking from the Sentinel Villages' quantitative data collection effort, the team has obtained detailed budget data, including realization reports, cashbooks and financial receipts from 110 villages. Currently, the team is analyzing financial transaction data and expects to make available initial findings in the following quarter (Q3/2016);
- **Civil Service Database Analysis.** In collaboration with *Badan Kepegawaian Nasional (BKN)*, the PSF

Analytics team intends to conduct an empirical analysis of the civil service database, which can help the GOI identify policy and organizational strategies that can better enable civil servants to improve public service delivery and development effectiveness. This quarter (Q2), the BKN agreed to the Terms of Reference prepared by the team, and the team will start data analysis activities in the following quarter (Q3/2016);

- Following the recently JMC-approved project proposal initiated by the Poverty team '*Using Evidence to Support Government Poverty Reduction Efforts at the Local Level in Indonesia*,' the PSF Analytics team, together with other Bank task teams, will conduct a series of activities to improve data quality necessary for enhancing service delivery. In particular, the PSF Analytics team will support Component 3 of the project by providing technical assistance to improve the quality of existing national survey and census instruments, such as SUSENAS and the Village Potential (*Potensi Desa*, PODES), as well as civil service data, by providing subnational data on service delivery. These activities will support the GOI to identify data gaps, increase data coverage, improve data quality, and strengthen data usage in national and local policy processes; and
- **SUSENAS Consumption Experiment (Quantitative).** Together with the World Bank Research Group (DREC), the PSF Analytics team jointly carried out the SUSENAS Consumption Experiment to support BPS to improve the quality of consumption data collected through its annual socioeconomic survey (SUSENAS). This quarter, the team has conducted double entry as part of the data cleaning process and will complete data analysis by September (end of Q3/2016).

Critical challenges

Throughout this quarter, the PSF Analytics team continues to face a number of technical and operational challenges across various projects leading to significant delays in study implementation. The first and foremost is the weak capacity of the local partner research institution in producing good quality analysis and final written reports. To mitigate the challenge, the team has regularly engaged its partner by providing capacity building support and on-the-job training to improve analytical and structured writing skills.

The second challenge is associated with site selection. For the quantitative study (i.e., the SUSENAS Consumption Experiment project), the team utilizes a random selection method to identify sample locations. As a result, some of the areas selected are found to be difficult for data collection efforts (e.g., areas with a high level of conflict or crime). To overcome this challenge, the team has obtained permission from local leaders and village apparatuses to carry out data collection efforts. As such, data collection efforts continue as planned and have been safeguarded by the local communities. Lessons learned from this event are twofold, namely: (i) it is critical to have a quick and flexible field strategy to face challenging environment; and (ii) good relationships and continuous communication with local village leaders and apparatuses are important to ensure smooth implementation.

Activities planned during the next quarter

Village Governance & Community Empowerment Study: Following a positive response from the first teleconference in April 2016, the team with SMERU will hold another discussion on VL implementation in study locations. The planned teleconference will be conducted by August (Q3/2016), once all the local researchers resume duty from the *Idul Fitri* holiday. In addition, the qualitative baseline report will also be ready by July (Q3/2016).

SUSENAS Consumption Experiment: Following the data collection completed this quarter, the team will work together with the World Bank DREC to perform data analysis on a simulation exercise that will utilize six experimental survey instruments as well as explore recommendations to improve the future consumption module. The team will also begin drafting the project report by September (Q3/2016).

Generasi Impact Evaluation: In the next quarter, the PSF Analytics team will conduct another round of field tests on the quantitative instruments in West Java. The mission will start on July 28th and will include representatives from the Generasi IE Steering Committee. Subsequently, a training of trainers (TOT) will be conducted in September (Q3/2016).

PEKKA Qualitative Study: The team will receive the first draft of the qualitative report from the lead researcher (July (Q3/2016) followed by a presentation to PEKKA for sharing findings and obtaining feedback by August (Q3/2016).

Key Performance Indicators								
Indicator	Baseline	Cumulative Target	Cumulative Achievements	VAR	Target for 2016	Achieved in Q2 2016	VAR	Remarks
Project Development Objective: To provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the results and impact of PNPM Mandiri; research in greater depth special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia; enhance the ability of Indonesian social science research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies.								
Component 1: Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) activities provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the result and impact of PNPM Mandiri. ²³								
Findings/evidence from evaluations launched in 2014 - 2015 reviewed as part of PNPM transition and Village Law (VL) implementation Processes	n/a	4 evaluations disseminated to PNPM and VL Stakeholders ⁴	1	-3	2 evaluations disseminated (PEKKA Evaluation and Rural Final Evaluation) to Village Law and PNPM Stakeholders	0	-2	<p>Cumulative: For the 3 remaining studies, 1 is in the preparation stage, 1 is in the analysis stage, and 1 is in the final stage</p> <p>2016: - PEKKA is analyzing qualitative data and preparing the report draft - Rural Evaluation data analysis has been finalized and the final report is being prepared - Generasi Impact Evaluation still in progress: has conducted its first round of quantitative instruments field test</p>

² Indicator 1.3 - Revised Results Framework (RF) and associated program of evaluations for Rural 2012-2014 has been removed, since it was completed in 2014

³ Indicator 1.1 - Findings/evidence from 2012-2013 round of evaluations reviewed as part of PNPM Roadmap process has been removed, since it was completed in 2015

⁴ Generasi Impact Evaluation, Creative Communities Phase II evaluation (Baseline), PEKKA Evaluation and Rural Evaluation.

Key Performance Indicators								
Indicator	Baseline	Cumulative Target	Cumulative Achievements	VAR	Target for 2016	Achieved in Q2 2016	VAR	Remarks
Component 2: Research in greater depth undertaken regarding special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia.⁵								
New 2014 studies launched (Sentinel Villages, Accountability Initiative, and Disaster Management Support (DMS))	n/a	3 studies launched and completed	1	-2	1 evaluation completed (Accountability Initiative)	0	-1	<p>Cumulative: On-Track: the 2 remaining studies are currently in implementation phase</p> <p>2016: - Village Governance & Community Empowerment studies team is preparing a qualitative baseline report and analyzing quantitative data; - Accountability Initiative is analyzing village financial transaction data</p>
Component 3: Ability of Indonesian social research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies enhanced.⁶								
% of ongoing studies involving Indonesian research institutions	n/a	100%	100%	On target	100%	100%	On target	
Support for BPS SUSENAS Consumption Module Simulation Conducted	n/a	Concept developed, simulation launched and completed, results used by	Simulation exercise is ongoing	Slightly delayed	Completed	Simulations are implemented, consumption data has been collected	Slight delay	Although experiencing slight delays due to changes in BPS leadership in the previous quarter, this project has gone back

⁵ Indicator 2.2 - Analytical pipeline for 2013-2014 finalized in consultation with key partners has been removed since it was accomplished in 2014

⁶ Indicator 3.2 - Strategy for the capacity-building of Indonesian research institutions endorsed by JMC has been removed since it was accomplished in 2014.

Key Performance Indicators								
Indicator	Baseline	Cumulative Target	Cumulative Achievements	VAR	Target for 2016	Achieved in Q2 2016	VAR	Remarks
		BPS to improve quality of SUSENAS data				followed by double data entry		on track. Data has been collected and is currently being double entered as part of data quality assurance.