

M&E and Special Studies

Quarterly Progress Report: Jan to March 2016

Summary Information	
Status	Active
Activity Number	P112032 (TF092195), P153589 (TFOA0461), P152466 (TF018564), P154636 (EW-P154636-ESW-TFOA0258), and P154484 (TA-P154484-TAS-TFOA0258)
Task Team Leader(s)	Lily Hoo (lhoo@worldbank.org)
Executing Agency(ies)	PNPM Support Facility (PSF)/World Bank
Start date to Closing Date	26 May 2008 to 31 December 2017 (115 months)
Geographic Coverage	National
Approved Budget	US\$15,629,194
Disbursements during the Quarter	US\$462,964 (190,254+272,710)
Cumulative Disbursements	US\$11,652,957 (238,695+11,414,262)

Progress

Project Overview

The monitoring and evaluation (M&E) activities conducted by the PNPM Support Facility (PSF) aim to: (i) provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the results and impacts of PNPM Mandiri; (ii) conduct research in greater depth on special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia; and (iii) enhance the ability of Indonesian social science research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies.

Overall progress towards development objective

The overall progress of PSF Analytics program towards its project development objective (PDO) continues to be satisfactory. Since its inception in 2009, the program has consistently supported the Government of Indonesia (GoI) in terms of policy formulation and program implementation through high quality, evidence-based analytical works. Utilizing a wide variety of mixed-research methods, the PSF Analytics team has successfully completed 17¹ evaluations/thematic studies to support PNPM Mandiri and other smaller initiatives in response to the research needs of the projects. To ensure continuation of excellent support to the GoI and other stakeholders, the team's approach remains consistent in quality, relevance and timeliness of evaluation and analysis, while expanding its partnership in delivery of analytical products and knowledge management and dissemination.

The team has been working towards finalization of ongoing projects such as PNPM Generasi Performance Monitoring Survey (PMS) and the PNPM Rural Final Evaluation. In addition to that, the team continues to implement a number of analytic works such as Village Governance and Community Empowerment study (referred to as the "Sentinel Villages Study"), which aims to track Village Law implementation for the period over two-years, and the Accountability Initiatives Experiment, which will provide key data needed in support of the Village Law implementation. The team also continues to

¹ A complete list of Analytics Products is available at: <http://pnpm-support.org/about/about-jmc>

support Indonesia's research institutions to deliver high-quality analytic works through intensive capacity-building project with the National Statistical Agency (*Badan Pusat Statistik/BPS*) in order to carry out SUSENAS (*Survey Sosial Ekonomi Nasional*, the National Socioeconomic Survey) Consumption Experiment, which aims to improve the quality of consumption data collected through the agency's annual socioeconomic survey.

Key developments during the quarter

Throughout the first quarter of 2016, the Analytics team completed a number of activities that contribute towards achieving its development objective, as follows:

- **PNPM/RESPEK² Papua Beneficiary Survey (Quantitative)³**: The objective of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness of PNPM Rural and RESPEK in two provinces, namely Papua and West Papua, between 2009 and 2013. While the qualitative part of this study - was published in 2015 and focuses on the context and the views of community members, the analysis of the quantitative component pays close attention in capturing overarching patterns and changes across regions throughout the time. The survey covers 16,000 households in 40 districts across both provinces, including remote and difficult-to-reach areas that were conducted through National Socio-Economic Survey (SUSENAS) carried out by BPS in 2009 and 2013. The final report was recently published on the PSF website in March 2016.
- **PNPM Rural Final Evaluation (Quantitative Methods)**. As part of the PNPM Rural completion, this evaluation aims to measure the program impacts across four key components, namely: (i) Technical Quality of three types of infrastructure (roads & bridges, irrigation, and clean water supply systems); (ii) Economic Impact Analysis; (iii) Beneficiaries' Satisfaction; and (iv) Revolving Loan Funds (RLF). This quarter, the team has been analyzing technical and household survey data and the report is expected to be ready by May (Q2/2016).
- **PNPM Generasi Performance Monitoring Survey (PMS) 2014 (Mixed-Methods)**. Implemented together with the Center for Population and Policy Studies of the University of Gadjah Mada (PSKK UGM), this study tracks the performance of PNPM Generasi's 12 result indicators throughout 2014, as well as identifies and analyzes bottlenecks in the program implementation. While the quantitative report was completed in 2015, the qualitative report faces significant delays in finalization due to weak capacity of the consulting firm. The team has hence taken over final analysis as well as the re-writing of the report. It is expected that the final report will be ready by May (Q2 2016).
- **PNPM Generasi Impact Evaluation (mixed-methods)**. This fourth round of the PNPM Generasi Impact Evaluation aims to assess the program's long-term impact, utilizing a randomized control trial (RCT) approach combined with qualitative methods to better understand how and why the program has achieved its impact. It also intends to elaborate on the potential of adopting PNPM Generasi's incentive model to support development of the basic service delivery approach under the Village Law implementation. On the quantitative side, this study will employ a large-scale panel survey that will involve more than 18,000 households in 300 kecamatan (sub-districts) across five provinces. Currently, the team is carrying out a competitive selection process to involve a qualified research institute to collect quantitative data.
- **PEKKA Endline Survey (Quantitative Methods)**: The objective of this study is to better understand how PEKKA can reduce poor female-headed households' marginalization, namely limited access and control over resources. Employing a panel household survey approach, this evaluation involves 2,400 households in 24 villages across four districts. In this quarter, the team remains finalizing the overview report that will present an analysis on various issues emerging throughout PEKKA implementation, such as household savings and consumption,

² RESPEK: Rencana Strategis Pembangunan Kampung/ Village Development Strategic Plan, a CDD program implemented in Papua and West Papua

³ Full Report is available at http://psflibrary.org/catalog/repository/3906_Beneficiary%20Assessment%20of%20PNPM-RESPEK_ENG.pdf

household social capital/network, and household financial access and risk profile. It is expected that the final report will be ready by end of May (Q2/2016). In addition, to enrich the quantitative findings, the team is also preparing to conduct qualitative case study, which will be carried out also in Q2.

- **Village Governance & Community Empowerment Study (Mixed Methods).** This longitudinal study aims to observe VL implementation over two years to understand whether the principles of good governance (participation, transparency and accountability) stipulated in the law can be articulated into managing village resources in an accountable manner to benefit the community. This study employs a wide range of qualitative and quantitative methods such as in-depth interviews, focus group discussion, observation, media tracking and household survey.
- **On the quantitative side,** 25 local enumerators have been deployed to 112 villages in five districts across three provinces to conduct household, village official, village council and activists surveys. It is expected that data collection will be completed by the end of this quarter.
- **On the qualitative side,** draft of the baseline report has been submitted to the team and final report will be ready by mid-May (Q2/2016). In addition, under the PSF team's oversight, SMERU has published its first policy note about the role of Kecamatan (Sub-District) in the VL implementation⁴.
- **Accountability Initiative (Quantitative).** As part of key analytical works under the broader Village Law Programmatic Advisory Services and Analytics (PASA-VL), this experiment elucidate factors that enable or constraint good governance practice within communities or local government. To assist National Audit Board (BPK) in narrowing down potential fraud cases to be followed up by audit through systematic analysis on village expenditure reports, the team initiates to test out 'digit analysis' method to analyze whether the financial reports have been altered. Currently, the team is collecting sample of financial transaction documents, including village expenditure reports, and also APBDes, piggybacking from Sentinel Village quantitative data collection.
- **Civil Service Database Analysis.** In collaboration with Badan Kepegawaian Nasional (BKN), the PSF Analytics team intends to conduct an empirical analysis of the agency's large civil service database, which can help the Gol to better enable civil servants to improve the delivery of core services. The team has prepared the Terms of Reference (TOR) for this initiative and is currently conducting further consultations with BKN to finalize the TOR and commence this analysis.
- **SUSENAS Consumption Experiment.** Together with BPS, the World Bank Research Group, and the Poverty Team Indonesia, the PSF Analytics team jointly carried out the SUSENAS Consumption Experiment to improve the quality of consumption data, collected through its annual socioeconomic survey (SUSENAS). After a series of implementation delays, this quarter, the team together with BPS carried out a Training of Trainers (TOT) workshop in Bogor (February 9-11) to familiarize BPS trainers with the six final questionnaire sets developed under this project. Lastly, a Training of Enumerators (TOE) was also carried out from February 29 to March 10, in Puncak. This TOE aims to train 56 newly recruited BPS enumerators that will carry out the simulation. To help the enumerators maintain the consistency of consumption data collected, the team also developed food items photo guide as a supplementary tool for conducting the survey. The teams of enumerators have now been deployed to start data collection in nine districts across three provinces (South Sumatra, Central Java, and South Sulawesi), involving for more than 1,000 households.

Critical challenges

Throughout this quarter, the team continues to face a number of challenges, which has led to substantial delays in project implementation and report publishing. The first and foremost challenge

⁴ Policy note is available at: <http://www.smeru.or.id/id/content/peran-kecamatan-dalam-pelaksanaan-uu-desa>

entails changes in BPS leadership, which occurred at the end of the preparation stage of the SUSENAS Simulation Experiment and has affected project implementation, since the new Director disagreed with some requirements of enumerators stipulated in the contract. To overcome this challenge, the team initiated a number of coordination meetings with the new Director to explain project details and rationale behind decisions made previously, which eventually resulted in his acceptance of the requirements, as well as support to carry on with the project.

Secondly, the capacity of local partner research institutions in producing good quality analyses and writing has long been a critical issue, in addition to finding qualified consultants to perform good analyses and writing of final reports. The team has consistently engaged its local partners through continuous capacity-building support, as well as on-the-job training throughout the study/evaluation process. This however requires significant time investments, which often contributes to delays in finalizing reports for publication.

Activities planned during the next quarter

Village Governance & Community Empowerment Study: In the next quarter, the team together with Village Law team will conduct a conference call with SMERU and the five local researchers to share the initial findings from this study, as well as to hear the researchers' experiences in attending various development planning meetings in hamlets, villages, sub-districts, and districts. The purpose of the discussion is to provide opportunities to learn from their firsthand observations of Village Law implementation since October 2015, and to share information/concerns with them to help sharpen the focus of their observations going forward. Furthermore, the qualitative baseline report will also be ready by mid-May 2016.

SUSENAS Consumption Experiment: In the next quarter, together with BPS, the team will continue to collect data, which will then be followed by data analysis and reporting. It is expected that the final report of this simulation will be ready by the end of June 2016.

Key Performance Indicators

Indicator	Baseline	Cumulative Target	Cumulative Achievements	VAR	Target for 2016	Achieved in Q2 2016	VAR	Remarks
Project Development Objective: To provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the results and impact of PNPM Mandiri; research in greater depth special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia; enhance the ability of Indonesian social science research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies.								
Component 1: Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) activities provide stakeholders with empirical data regarding the result and impact of PNPM Mandiri.⁵⁶								
Findings/evidence from evaluations launched in 2014 - 2015 reviewed as part of PNPM transition and Village Law (VL) implementation Processes	n/a	4 evaluations disseminated to PNPM and VL Stakeholders ⁴	1 study at the preparation stage, 2 studies at implementation stage, and 1 study completed	3 studies remain ongoing	2 evaluations disseminated (PEKKA Evaluation and PNPM Rural Final Evaluation) to Village Law and PNPM Stakeholders	Generasi IE still in preparation stage; PNPM Rural Final Evaluation in analysis stage; and PEKKA Evaluation at the stage of writing final report and preparing a qualitative	-2 (PEKKA Evaluation & PNPM Rural Final Evaluation)	Generasi Impact Evaluation has conducted firm selection process; PNPM Rural Evaluation is analyzing data (technical evaluation and household survey); PEKKA is writing final report and preparing qualitative case study
Component 2: Research in greater depth undertaken regarding special topics of concern to PNPM and the social development field in Indonesia.⁸⁵								
New 2014 studies launched (Sentinel Villages, Accountability Initiative, and Disaster Management Support (DMS))	n/a	3 studies launched and completed	1 study completed; 2 studies in implementation stage	On track	1 evaluation completed, 2 studies in preparation and 1 evaluation in stage of preparing the concept	1 study is being written, qualitative baseline report and quantitative data being collected; 1 study is in the	On track	Disaster Management Support study completed (as part of Implementation Completion Report); Village Governance & Community Empowerment studies are preparing

⁵ Indicator 1.3 - Revised Results Framework (RF) and associated program of evaluations for PNPM Rural 2012-2014 has been removed, since it was completed in 2014

⁶ Indicator 1.1 - Findings/evidence from 2012-2013 round of evaluations reviewed as part of PNPM Roadmap process has been removed, since it was completed in 2015

⁷ PNPM Generasi Impact Evaluation, Creative Communities Phase II evaluation (Baseline), PEKKA Evaluation and PNPM Rural Evaluation.

⁸ Indicator 2.2 - Analytical pipeline for 2013-2014 finalized in consultation with key partners has been removed since it was accomplished in 2014

Key Performance Indicators

Indicator	Baseline	Cumulative Target	Cumulative Achievements	VAR	Target for 2016	Achieved in Q2 2016	VAR	Remarks
						phase of data being collected		quantitative baseline report and collecting quantitative data; Accountability initiative is collecting village expenditure data, piggybacking on Sentinel Villages quantitative data collection.
Component 3: Ability of Indonesian social research organizations to conduct M&E and special studies enhanced.⁹⁶								
% of ongoing studies involving Indonesian research institutions	n/a	100%	100%	On target	100%	100%	On target	
Support for BPS SUSENAS Consumption Module Simulation Conducted	n/a	Concept developed, simulation launched and completed, results used by BPS to improve quality of SUSENAS data	Simulation exercise is ongoing	Slightly delayed	Completed	Simulations are implemented, consumption data has been collected	Slightly delayed	Experiencing slight delay due to changes in BPS leadership that affect implementation plans.

⁹ Indicator 3.2 - Strategy for the capacity-building of Indonesian research institutions endorsed by JMC has been removed since it was accomplished in 2014.